

1998

Australian Spanish-speaking background secondary school students and the construction and reconstruction of their cultural identity: a "wog" experience

David Alejandro Plaza-Coral

University of Wollongong

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses>

University of Wollongong

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

Recommended Citation

Plaza-Coral, David Alejandro, Australian Spanish-speaking background secondary school students and the construction and reconstruction of their cultural identity: a "wog" experience, Doctor of Philosophy thesis, Faculty of Education, University of Wollongong, 1998. <https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/1771>

Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au

NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

**AUSTRALIAN SPANISH-SPEAKING BACKGROUND SECONDARY
SCHOOL STUDENTS AND THE CONSTRUCTION AND
RECONSTRUCTION OF THEIR CULTURAL IDENTITY:
A "WOG" EXPERIENCE**

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the
requirements for the award of the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

from

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

by

DAVID ALEJANDRO PLAZA-CORAL
M.Ed. (Brazil), B.A. in Philosophy (Chile)

FACULTY OF EDUCATION

1998

D E C L A R A T I O N

I certify that the substance of this thesis has not already been submitted for any degree and is not being currently submitted for any other degree.

I certify that any help received in preparing this thesis, and all sources used, have been acknowledged in this thesis.

Signed

.....

David Alejandro Plaza-Coral

D E D I C A T I O N

To Erica, my wife, whose constant support and encouragement has always been present in the almost four years we have spent in Australia. She stoically left behind her work, relatives and friends in Brazil to accompany me on my academic journey.

I owe her a debt of gratitude for her love, patience and devotion.

In this time she bravely and determinedly faced the English language and now can communicate almost without accent, making in that way her stay away from home a less painful experience. Now she speaks three languages: Portuguese, Spanish and English.

Because of her wonderful personality she made a lot of friends from all around the world. "You will be missed" have been the words they said when they saw us off.

A C K N O W L E D G M E N T S

I would like to express my profound thanks and gratitude to my supervisors Dr. Janice Wright and Dr. Christine Fox who, during the process and writing of this study were, in addition to being persistent and careful critics, a constant source of motivation and encouragement. Their copious and wise advice, and enthusiasm to discuss prolonged and intently many aspects of this project, were invaluable and much welcome. These things, combined with their limitless kindness and enormous consideration, helped to make the writing of this thesis a labour of satisfaction.

I thank the faculty librarian Keith Gaymer for helping me to get some of the statistical data

I also wish to thank all the children, parents, teachers and staff from the schools where I carried out this study. I really appreciate their collaboration and willingness to participate in this study.

A B S T R A C T

There are significant numbers of Spanish-speaking background students in Australian secondary schools, but as a linguistic cohort their experiences have generally been underrepresented in educational research. This study was undertaken to explore the ways in which one group of secondary school Spanish-speaking background students from three different countries negotiated their cultural identity in classrooms, at school and at home.

In any nation where the majority of its inhabitants has a migrant history, there are socio-economic, political, cultural and educational issues that specifically affect immigrants and the children of immigrants. This study deals with concepts of cultural identity and their relationships to education, immigration, language, multiculturalism and racism. Much of the literature does not speak for the subordinated "other" in society, particularly when looking within a multicultural society, as opposed to say, oppressed people in "other" countries. The literature tends to be about the relationships from the dominant society's viewpoints, or about the minority group's material gains and failures, and there is little in the literature which explains the richness of culture and identity of the "other" when seen from within that group.

This qualitative, multiple case study of twenty two students has allowed the participants the opportunity to tell their own stories about their lives and about their school experiences. The conceptual framework of the present study can be defined as an attempt to investigate the formation of identity in the context of those places where it is likely to be formed; that is to say the family, the school and the spaces in between.

The study was designed to be carried out in two phases. First, the students and their parents were interviewed about their experiences as immigrants or children of immigrants in Australia. Second, the students were observed when participating in Science, Mathematics and English lessons, so that critical incidents and interactions could be recorded. These data were checked with the students, and where possible their teachers were also interviewed either before or after the classes. The data were analysed to throw light upon those factors which both at home and at school appeared to play a crucial part in helping the students to define themselves in terms of their own subjectivities and their possible futures, as well as in relation to their family members, their peers, and other significant people in their lives.

It was found that these students move in and out of two different worlds, the one maintained mainly by their parents at home and the other of the wider society, mirrored in the school. It was also found that the complexities, puzzles and potential conflicts of the spaces in between these worlds were individually constructed, yet at the same time driven by the specific context in which the students found themselves — a context encompassing a particular political/ideological era (which favours certain, sometimes negative, attitudes towards notions of difference), the family's economic and educational background, the expectations of the parents, and the students' own age, experience, hopes and desires. Unlike their parents who appear caught in a cultural bubble, possibly because of their perceived deficiencies in the English language, the students are much freer to construct different, multi-faceted identities, while generally appreciating their place in the family's heritage.

R E S U M E N

Números significativos de estudiantes que tienen como origen lingüístico la lengua española estudian en escuelas secundarias australianas, sin embargo como grupo lingüístico sus experiencias han estado generalmente mal representadas en la investigación educacional. Este estudio fue llevado a cabo para explorar las formas en que un grupo de estudiantes secundarios de origen lingüístico español de tres diferentes países negociaban su identidad cultural en la sala de clases, en la escuela y en el hogar.

En cualquier nación donde la mayoría de sus habitantes tiene una historia de inmigrante, hay problemas socio-económicos, políticos, culturales y educacionales que específicamente afectan a los inmigrantes y a los hijos de inmigrantes. Este estudio tiene que ver con conceptos de identidad cultural y sus relaciones con educación, inmigración, lenguaje, multiculturalismo y racismo. La mayoría de la literatura no habla por el subordinado "otro" en la sociedad, particularmente cuando se trata dentro de una sociedad multicultural, en oposición digamos, a la gente oprimida en "otros" países. La literatura tiende a ser acerca de las relaciones desde puntos de vista de la sociedad dominante, o acerca del grupo minoritario y sus ganos materiales y sus fracasos, y hay poco en la literatura que explique la riqueza de cultura y identidad del "otro" cuando es visto desde dentro de ese grupo.

Este estudio cualitativo de casos múltiples de veinte y dos estudiantes ha permitido que los participantes tengan la oportunidad de contar sus propias historias acerca de sus vidas y acerca de sus experiencias en la escuela. El marco conceptual del presente estudio puede ser definido como un intento para investigar la formación de la identidad en el contexto de aquellos

lugares donde es más probable que se forme, es decir la familia, la escuela y los espacios intermedios.

El estudio fue diseñado para ser llevado a cabo en dos fases. Primero, los estudiantes y sus padres fueron entrevistados acerca de sus experiencias como inmigrantes o hijos de inmigrantes en Australia. Segundo, los estudiantes fueron observados cuando participaban en las clases de ciencia, matemáticas e inglés, para así poder grabar las interacciones y los incidentes críticos. Esta información fue analizada para iluminar aquellos factores que tanto en casa como en la escuela parecen jugar una parte crucial en ayudar a los estudiantes a definirse a sí mismos en términos de su propia subjetividad y sus posibles futuros, así como también en relación con sus familia, sus compañeros, y otras personas significativas en la vida de ellos.

Se encontró que estos estudiantes se mueven dentro y fuera de dos mundos diferentes, el mantenido principalmente por sus padres y el otro el de la sociedad en general, que se refleja en la escuela. Se encontró también que las complejidades, los enigmas y conflictos potenciales de los espacios intermedios de estos mundos eran individualmente construidos, sin embargo al mismo tiempo derivados del contexto específico en el cual los estudiantes se encontraban a sí mismos — un contexto que acompaña una era particular, política/ideológica (que favorece ciertas, a veces negativas actitudes hacia aquellas nociones de diferencia), el trasfondo económico y educacional de la familia, las expectativas de los padres y la edad, experiencia, esperanzas y deseos de los propios estudiantes. Diferente de sus padres que parecen atrapados en una burbuja cultural, posiblemente debido a sus percibidas deficiencias en la lengua inglesa, los estudiantes son mucho más libres para construir identidades diferentes y multifacéticas, al mismo tiempo que aprecian su lugar en la herencia familiar.

A B B R E V I A T I O N S

ALP	Australian Labour Party
CMEP	Child Migrant Education Program
DEET	Department of Employment, Education and Training
DEETYA	Department of Employment, Education, Training and Youth Affairs.
DELE	Diploma de Español como Lengua Extranjera (Certificate of Spanish as a Foreign Language)
DIEA	Department of Immigration and Ethnic Affairs
EAPS	Ethnic Affairs Policy Statement
ESL	English as a Second Language
HSC	Higher School Certificate
LBOTE	Language Background other than English
LOTE	Language Other Than English
MERCOSUR	Free Trade Market among Argentina, Brazil, Paraguay and Uruguay
NAATI	National Accreditation Authority for Translators and Interpreters
NACCME	National Advisory and Co-ordinating Committee on Multicultural Education
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
NESB	Non-English speaking background
NSW	New South Wales
SAE	Standard Australian English
SC	School Certificate
TAFE	Tertiary and Further Education

T A B L E O F C O N T E N T S

Declaration	ii
Dedication	iii
Acknowledgement	iv
Abstract	v
Resumen	vii
Abreviations	ix
List of Tables	xiv
List of Appendices	xv
Emigrar	1
To emigrate	1
Chapter One: INTRODUCTION	2
1.1 Aims	2
1.2 Rationale	4
1.3 Organisation of the Study	11
1.4 Description of the Study	13
1.5 An Autobiographical Note	15
Migration	19
La Emigración	19
Chapter Two: LITERATURE REVIEW	20
2.1 Immigrants' Identity	21
2.2 Identity and Language	30
2.3 Identity and Multiculturalism	33
2.3.1 Multicultural Education	41
2.4 Relationship between Difference, Multiculturalism and Racism	48
2.5 Conclusion	56
Gathering	58
Reunirse	58
Chapter Three: METHODOLOGY	59
3.1 Research Design	60
3.2 Research Questions	65
3.3 Research Processes	66

3.3.1	Research Process Stage One: Students and Parents	66
3.3.2	Research Process Stage Two: School and Classroom Contexts.....	73
3.4	Data Analysis Procedures.....	77
3.5	Conclusion.....	78
	El Refugiado	81
	Refugee.....	82
	Chapter Four: SPANISH BACKGROUND STUDENTS.....	83
4.1	Carlota.....	85
4.2	Sergio.....	90
4.3	Sisters Anabel and Marta.....	94
4.4	Fernanda.....	100
4.5	Braulio.....	104
4.6	Damaso.....	108
4.7	Juan.....	110
4.8	Rita.....	113
4.9	Conclusion.....	116
	Traídos Por La Ruleta	118
	Brought by the Roulette	118
	Chapter Five: CHILEAN BACKGROUND STUDENTS.....	126
5.1	Gonzalo.....	128
5.2	Violeta.....	133
5.3	Patricia.....	138
5.4	Sisters Ester and Helena.....	141
5.5	Noelia.....	146
5.6	Berta.....	149
5.7	Brothers Ivan and Luis	153
5.8	Orlando	157
5.9	Quimera	160
5.10	Conclusion	164
	Los Nuevos Invasores	166
	The new Invaders.....	167
	Chapter Six: URUGUAYAN BACKGROUND STUDENTS... 168	
6.1	Ursula	169

6.2	Zulma	174
6.3	Conclusion	178
	Be Happy	180
	Sé Feliz.....	180
Chapter Seven: CLASSROOM CHALLENGE.....		181
7.1	The Physical Context	183
7.2	The Teachers	185
7.3	The English, Mathematics and Science Classes	188
7.3.1	Upper Stream Classes.....	189
7.3.1.1	English and Mathematics Classes.....	190
	Luis (5.7).....	191
	Ester (5.4).....	197
7.3.2	Intermediate Stream Classes.....	199
7.3.2.1	English Classes.....	200
	Sergio (4.2).....	200
	Helena (5.4).....	202
	Orlando (5.8).....	205
	Ester (5.4).....	207
	Marta (4.4) and Ursula (6.1).....	208
7.3.2.2	Mathematics Classes.....	212
	Helena (5.4).....	212
	Damaso (4.6).....	213
	Orlando (5.8).....	215
	Marta (4.3).....	216
7.3.2.3	Science Classes.....	218
	Luis (5.7).....	218
	Sergio (4.2).....	219
	Juan (4.7).....	221
	Damaso (4.6).....	222
	Orlando (5.8).....	223
	Marta (4.3).....	224
7.3.3	Lower Stream Classes.....	226
7.3.3.1	English Classes.....	227
	Berta (5.6).....	227
	Juan (4.7) and Damaso (4.6).....	231
	Patricia (5.3).....	233
	Fernanda (4.4).....	236

Quimera (5.9).....	237
7.3.3.2 Mathematics Classes.....	239
Sergio (4.2)	239
Berta (5.6)	240
Juan (4.7)	241
Patricia (5.3).....	242
Fernanda (4.4) and Ursula (6.1).....	243
Quimera (5.9).....	245
7.3.3.3 Science Classes.....	246
Helena (5.4).....	246
Berta (5.6).....	247
Patricia (5.3).....	249
Ester (5.4).....	249
Fernanda (4.4) and Ursula (6.1).....	251
Quimera (5.9).....	252
7.4 Conclusion	252
Renegada	255
A Renegade Woman.....	255
Chapter Eight: DISCUSSION THEMES.....	256
8.1 Cultural Bubble	257
8.2 Gringo versus Wog	263
8.3 Material Happiness	267
8.4 Frozen Time versus Freedom	271
8.5 Language Dependence versus Bilingualism	275
8.6 Language Clusters and Secret Codes at School	281
8.7 Isolation versus Freedom	286
8.8 Hopes and Aspirations	290
8.9 Conclusion	294
Difference and Otherness	295
Diferencia y Otrocidad.....	295
Chapter Nine: FINAL REMARKS.....	296
9.1 The Home Context.....	297
9.2 The School Context.....	299
9.3 Conclusion.....	306
REFERENCES.....	308

T A B L E S

Table 3.1:	Consent Letter.....	66
Table 3.2:	Students Interviewed.....	67
Table 3.3:	Participants Interviewed.....	71
Table 3.4:	Students Observed.....	75
Table 3.5:	Spanish Background Students.....	79
Table 3.6:	Chilean Background Students.....	79
Table 3.7:	Uruguayan Background Students.....	79
Table 4.1:	Spanish Background Families' Year of Arrival.....	84
Table 5.1:	Chilean Background Families' Year of Arrival.....	127
Table 7.1:	Classes Observed.....	182
Table 7.2:	Students Distribution by Class	188
Table 7.3:	Upper Stream Classes Observed.....	190
Table 7.4:	Intermediate Stream Classes Observed.....	200
Table 7.5:	Lower Stream Classes Observed.....	226

A P E N D I C E S

Appendix 1	Consent Letter (Spanish).....	319
Appendix 2	Consent Letter (English).....	321
Appendix 3:	Letter to the Principals.....	323
Appendix 4	Consent Letter (Negative Consent).....	324

Emigrar

Emigran los pájaros, las mariposas,
también los peces,
¿por qué no emigrar los hombres?

Los pajaros, las mariposas y los peces
emigran estimulados por la naturaleza
y casi siempre regresan a su lugar de origen.

Los hombres emigran
forzados por otros hombres
y casi nunca regresan a su natal terruño.

(Belarmino Sarna, 1992).

To Emigrate

Birds, butterflies emigrate
fish too,
why not people?

Birds, butterflies and fish
emigrate stimulated by nature
and they almost always return to their place of origin.

People emigrate
forced by other people
and they almost never return to their home land.

(My own translation).